Making Villages Open Defecation Free



Issues in institutionalisation of success

An analysis of succeeded/failed efforts by 41 villages in Maharashtra, Jharkhand & Odisha







Making Villages Open Defecation Free Issues in institutionalisation of success

An analysis of succeeded/failed efforts by 41 villages in Maharashtra, Jharkhand & Odisha







Conceived by Dr. Vinay Sahasrabuddhe Honorary Director, Public Policy Research Centre (PPRC), New Delhi

Under the Guidance of Sh. Popatrao Pawar, Sarpanch, Hiware Bazar

Research Team Sh. Abhishek M. Chaudhari Sh. Ujjwal Agrain Sh. Shubham Verma Sh. Milind Chalke

In Association with Sh. Anand Shekhar, Global Sanitation Fund



Preface

Ever since Swachh Bharat, a campaign mooted by Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi has been launched, sanitation and hygiene have occupied significant space in the popular discourse. One of the key targets under this mission was to make villages and cities free from Open Defecation. Hence, it has been very high on government's agenda. Several voluntary Orgnaisations are working towards this goal.

The government and international bodies have duly recognised successful efforts undertaken by many of these organisations. Also, many research organisations have conducted case-studies on the methodology adopted by the respective local self-government bodies.

However, these efforts have not resulted in institutionalisation of the success achieved by some town councils and village committees. Needless to say, if towns and villages fail to continue with the ODF status, it is not only a great loss of public resources but also a far too costly loss of momentum achieved so far. People's participation is the key to build best sanitation practices and if efforts towards their institutionalisation fail, we are back to square one, resulting in the spread of dreadful epidemic of cynicism.

No empirical data are available that can tell us the number of villages once proclaimed as ODF have relapsed into the Non-ODF category over a period of time. In the context of India, or the entire south Asia, where the system of defecating in open has multiple dimensions including social, cultural, community and economic, a unidirectional search for solutions may not lead to enduring solutions. This makes the task of institutionalisation of ODF mission more complicated.

With this realisation, Global Sanitation Fund, Delhi; Public Policy Research Centre, Delhi and Rambhau Mhalgi Prabodhini, Mumbai decided to come together to undertake a detailed study to understand the impact of the ODF mission. The study covers 41 villages from Maharashtra, Jharkhand and Odisha. The selected village were those which were once declared as Open Defecation Free and continue to be so. Moreover, the the study also includes villages that relapsed into non-ODF category. The study attempts to understand why have some of these villages failed to continue with the ODF status and others have not. Findings of this study are relevant not only for the policy makers but also for the implementing agencies.

Management science, based on Indian philosophy always refers to the concept of Karta, a doer who provides leadership from the front while owning responsibility in totality. Our research has found that villages where such a 'karta' or a leader was absent failed to continue with ODF status.

We hope that this research will help policy makers, implementers, voluntary organisations and villagers to understand the need for greater efforts to first achieve the ODF status and then never lose it. A development focused leadership will have to emerge from within the village communities to achieve the goal set under this mission. Government and the players involved into this would have to identify and reward such change agents emerging out of these village communities.

Dr. Vinay Sahasrabuddhe Honorary Director Public Policy Research Centre (PPRC), New Delhi





Contents

Preface	iii
Abbreviations	vi
Executive Summary	Vii
1. Introduction	1
2. Significance of Study	
3. Research Objectives	
4. Research Methodology	
5. Research Stretch	
6. Research Observations	7
7. Conclusion	
8. Key Learnings	
9. Recommendations	
Acknowledgement	
Citations	



Abbreviations

AIP	Annual Implementation Plan
ANM	Auxiliary Nursing Midwifery
BPL	Below Poverty line
DM	District Magistrate
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
Gol	Government of India
GSF	Global Sanitation Fund
IDF	Integrated Development Fund
IEC	Information, Education and Communication
IPC	Inter Personal Communication
MGNREGA	Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
ODF	Open Defecation Free
PEO	Panchayat Extension Officer
РНС	Primary Health Centre
PRI	Panchayati Raj Institution
RSTMGS	Rashtrasant Tukdoji Maharaja Gram Spardha (Tukdoji Mahraj Village competition)
SBM	Swachh Bharat Mission (Clean India Mission)
SGBGSA	Sant Gadage Baba Gram Swachhta Abhiyaan (Gadage Baba Village cleanliness mission)
SHG	Self Help Group
SLWM	Solid Liquid Waste Management
VWSC	Village Water and Sanitation Committee



Executive Summary

The practice of Open Defecation (ODF) is rampant in India. According to a study published by the United Nations University, more people in India have access to mobile phones than to toilets. Open Defecation poses a serious threat to human health. The country loses millions due to poor hygiene and sanitation practices. According to a study by WHO, 4650 children die every day due to diarrhea alone. Open Defecation is a leading cause of diarrhea, along with other dreaded diseases such as typhoid, cholera, dysentery and polio.

In order to institutionalise the ODF habits, the Government of India has proposed to spend more than \$19 billion by 2019. Majority of it is being spent on constructing toilets. Efforts are also being made to combat several behavioural and psychological aspects. Several villages have succeeded in creating local models of institutionalising ODF. Hence, the need of a research aimed at finding inspiring local practices and models was felt; the models that can be replicated at other places and can be considered in the policy framework to support the government mechanisms in achieving the desired goals.

For this research, Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM) guidelines were considered as primary framework and state level sanitation programs as secondary. The Research Design is descriptive and exploratory covering 41 villages from the states of Maharashtra, Jharkhand and Odisha. The study included 288 interviews of various stakeholders comprising School teachers, Anganwadi workers, PHC/ANMs, Panchayat members, bureaucrats, spiritual leaders, voluntary organisations, beneficiaries and village residents.

The study documented best practices which drove some villages succeed in their attempt to institutionalise ODF. Leadership emerged as one key factor in the endeavour. Different kind of leaders at various levels such as from bureaucrats, PRI Members, village volunteers and spiritual leaders, were pivotal in creating successful models. Such leaders ensured public participation and catalysed the pace of toilet adoption.

Innovation was yet another key to the institutionalising process. Creative awareness campaigns, local innovations in toilet construction and novel approaches towards adoption have been documented in the study. Lack of awareness is the biggest challenge in villages where institutionalising attempts have failed. Because of absence of the knowledge about ill-effects of defecating in open and indifference towards the need of having a toilet, people develop reluctance towards toilet adoption.

Several policy changes including time bound incentive in toilet construction, awareness campaign to bust the myth '3 feet deep toilet pit' will fill quickly and capacity building of officials has been suggested.





1. Introduction

Open defecation refers to the practice in which people go out in fields, bushes, forests, open bodies of water or other open spaces to defecate instead of using a toilet.

The practice of Open Defecation is rampant in India. According to the census reports of 2011, 792 million people in India don't have access to improved sanitation,ⁱ 69.3% of rural India had no access to toiletsⁱⁱ, only 56% of schools have usable toiletsⁱⁱⁱ and India suffered economic losses of 6.4% of GDP annually due to poor sanitation^{iv}. Open defecation poses a serious threat to the health of children in India. 13% of under-5 mortality is due to diarrhoea disease and the World Health Organisation has found that 88% of diarrhoea disease is caused by "unsafe water supply, inadequate sanitation and hygiene"^v. Of the children that survive, 48% are malnourished by height, 44% by weight and 21% are undernourished (below the ideal height/weight ratio). Only 11% of Indian rural families dispose off children's faeces safely, 80% of children's faeces are left in the open or thrown into the garbage^{vi}. According to a World Bank study, India loses 24,000 crore (\$54 Billion) annually due to lack of toilet and poor hygiene^{vii}.

The Government of India (Gol) has been working to promote sanitation and improve rural health since as 1954. The rural sanitation programme was first introduced in 1954 as a part of the First Five-Year Plan. The 1981 Census revealed rural sanitation coverage was only 1%^{viii}. Gol has spent as much as \$3 Billion since 1986 to achieve the target of total sanitation^{ix} through programs like Central Rural Sanitation Program (CRSP), Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC), Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA). Learning from the issues with previous programs and attempting to improve them, the Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM) was initiated by Gol on 2nd October, 2014. It has proposed to spend additional Rs. 1,34,000 crore (\$19 Billion) by 2019 to make the country free from open defecation.

Prime Minister Narendra Modi has repeatedly emphasised on the need of sanitation and toilet adoption. It is for the first time that the central government has prioritised the sanitation movement and has set a deadline for completion along with increasing incentive for toilet construction. The execution strategy has evolved and the mission is now time bound to make all the villages ODF by 2nd October, 2019. Furthermore, a Swachh Bharat Mission Cess[×] has been recently introduced to avoid any fund deficit to the mission.

Under the SBM, the Gol has successfully constructed more than 1.82 crore toilets upto May 10, 2016 (SBM Website). The entire state of Sikkim, Nadia district of West Bengal, Bikaner district of Rajasthan, Indore district of Madhya Pradesh and 19,501 Gram Panchayats have already been declared ODF.

The Central Rural Sanitation Programme (CRSP) emphasised on toilet construction and was highly subsidised for BPL families, however, it didn't promote toilet adoption. With NBA, the Gol had tried to make the sanitation programme 'demand driven'^{xi}. Hence, the focus was shifted from construction to awareness. Yet, demand failed to gain momentum on its own. Whereas, SBM attempts to bring the best of both approaches. In the first phase, SBM is focusing on community activation. Through national level campaigns, the Gol attempts to make owning a toilet aspirational.

Further, it aims to bring a sustainable change. The mission not only aims to make villages, open defecation free but it also aims to institutionalise ODF status i.e. to imbibe the culture of sanitation and toilet usage among people. The 'Swachh' village essentially gives sanitation the highest priority.

Several state governments have initiated local programmes, gaving push to clean sanitation drives. *Tajo Wagad Abhiyaan* in Rajasthan successfully made many villages ODF^{xii}. Churu district in Rajasthan had started



'Choko Churu' (Clean Churu) to encourage people to quit open defecation. Several blocks of Churu successfully became ODF under this movement.

Shobar Sauchagar (toilet for everyone) movement in West Bengal helped Nadia to become country's first ODF district^{xiii}. Hoogly, East Midnapore, North 24 Paraganas and several other districts also stepped up their speed to achieve the ODF status under this program^{xiv}. West Bengal declared April 30th as 'Nirmal Bangla Diwas' to promote awareness about the campaign.

These programs involve innovative social campaigns to bring about a behavioural change. Nadia, West Bengal, introduced a campaign to embarrass people defecating in open by pasting their pictures on the public platforms. Churu district in Rajasthan started a similar practice. They gave red stickers to villages where people still defecate in open^{xv}. Bikaner district in Rajasthan made a *Nigrani Committee* (Monitoring committee) of young people from the village to seek and shame those from the village who step out in the early hours of the morning to defecate in the open^{xvi}. Residents of villages in Indore Division, Madhya Pradesh also appointed *'Cleanliness Ambassadors'* who used to whistle to deter people defecating in open^{xvii}.

In 2000, the Government of Maharashtra introduced a policy to encourage villages and communities towards achieving the goal of total sanitation. Named 'Sant Gadage Baba Gram Swachhta Abhiyaan' (SGBGSA) and 'Rashtrasant Tukdoji Maharaj Swachh Gram Spardha' (RSTMSGS), the new policy introduced a competition of cleanliness among villages. Every year, awards were given to Gram Panchayats for their excellence in sanitation. In last ten years, many villages received awards under this campaign. Amongst them, several villages still continue to be role models in sanitation; however, many others have failed to institutionalise the ODF status.

In the first phase, the research identified SGBGSA award winning villages across different geographical regions of Maharashtra to find out reasons of their success in sustaining ODF status and challenges they faced in doing so. The research also identified villages which failed to sustain their ODF status and tried to understand the reasons behind it. In order to make the study more comprehensive, several villages that have not yet participated in the campaign were also studied during the research.

In the second phase of the research, the study team aimed at assessing the impact of Swachh Bharat Mission. Finding that Jharkhand had the highest rate of open defecation in 2011, the state was also selected as the research area.

According to the 2011 census reports, as much as 92.4% households in Jharkhand defecated in open which was worst in the country^{xviii}. Nevertheless, there are reports of rapid improvement in this status under the SBM. This made Jharkhand an important case for studying impact of the mission. The research also tried to assess the challenges faced by the state in the implementation of the mission. Thus, for the second phase of this study, some OD and ODF village from Jharkhand were randomly selected.

In the third phase, the 'Angul Model' from Odisha was studied. A unique^{xix} community led approach was undertaken in the Angul block of Angul district in Odisha towards creating ODF villages. Overall, the research tries to understand the best practices that can be replicated throughout the country.



2. Significance of Study

The Swachh Bharat Mission aims to make India Open Defecation Free (ODF) by 2019; and 800 million new toilets are to be constructed till 2019. However, it is not an easy task as there are systemic issues in implementation of the mission. The challenges faced at various levels in achieving ODF is the key concern of this study.

Various communities have presented innovative models for creating ODF villages, yet there has been no substantial study of such models and the scope of their replication. So, at PPRC (Public Policy Research Centre), it was conceived that such models should be scanned and studied. Thereby, PPRC and RMP (Rambhau Mhalgi Prabodhini) in collaboration with Global Sanitation Fund (GSF) undertook this study.

3. Research Objectives

- To document the best practices and challenges faced during institutionalisation of ODF.
- To propose recommendations based on the key learnings from success stories and reasons of failures.

4. Research Methodology

The research is mainly based on the empirical and qualitative methods. This work aims at studying the process of institutionalising ODF successes in India. For this purpose, the case study method was adopted. The pattern of selection of the cases was different for each state; a unique case from Odisha was selected as it provided model for best practices; villages from Maharashtra were chosen purposively on the basis of their performance; whereas, cases from Jharkhand were randomly taken up.

The sources used for this study included both primary and secondary sources; however, conclusions were drawn mainly on the basis of observations and findings of the field work. The research team visited all the cases under study and conducted a field based survey. This included personal visits to schools, gram sabhas, government offices and also to private households; and interviews of political leaders, bureaucrats, social workers, school teachers, anganwadi workers as well as of spiritual leaders.

5. Research Stretch

The research team conducted the research in three phases. It travelled to 41 villages of the states of Maharashtra, Jharkhand and Odisha.

In the first phase, the team covered 15 villages across 6 districts and 3 regions of Maharashtra, traveling a distance of 5930 KMs and interviewing 127 people. This trip started from Hiware Bazar in Ahmednagar district in Western Maharashtra and concluded at Wagdhara in Nagpur district in eastern Vidarbha.





In the second phase, the team visited 21 villages spread over 4 districts of Jharkhand, traveling 5470 KMs and interviewing 137 people. The villages were randomly selected to create a heterogeneous mix. The study started from the southern districts of the state, Saraikela - Kharsawan and got completed in Deoghar, the northern part of the state.

In the third phase, the team travelled to the Angul district of Odisha. 5 villages from this district were randomly selected to understand the unique community approach that has led to its ODF status. During the study, the team travelled 450 KMs and interviewed 24 people.



Village Statistics

The villages covered and their vital statistics based on primary research are as follows:

S. No	State	Village	Block	District	Year of attaining ODF status	Status	Number of households	Number of toilets
1.	Maharashtra	Hiware Bazar	Nagar	Ahmednagar	2006-07	ODF	246	246
2.	Maharashtra	Kingaon	Phulambri	Aurangabad	2009-10	OD	653	523
3.	Maharashtra	Mohare	Panhala	Kolhapur	2002-03	ODF	824	824
4.	Maharashtra	Ambawade	Panhala	Kolhapur	2013-14	ODF	324	324
5.	Maharashtra	Shelkewadi	Karveer	Kolhapur	2005-06	ODF	73	73
6.	Maharashtra	Salwan	Gaganbavda	Kolhapur	2004-05	ODF	48	48
7.	Maharashtra	Nivade	Gaganbavda	Kolhapur	2014-15	ODF	450	450
8.	Maharashtra	Borchandli	Mul	Chandrapur	2002-03, 03-04	OD	486	356
9.	Maharashtra	Virai	Mul	Chandrapur	2003-4, 04- 05, 05-06	OD	378	200
10.	Maharashtra	Rajgarh	Mul	Chandrapur	2002-03	ODF	348	350
11.	Maharashtra	Chandapur	Mul	Chandrapur	No Award	OD	459	156
12.	Maharashtra	Dhamangaon- Wathoda	Seloo	Wardha	2003-04	OD	274	152
13.	Maharashtra	Pimpalgaon - Wadala	Aarvi	Wardha	2001-02	ODF	284	284
14.	Maharashtra	Sirsoli	Aashti	Wardha	2000-01	ODF	173	173
15.	Maharashtra	Wagdhara	Hingana	Nagpur	2011-12	In- Process	704	606
16.	Jharkhand	Krushnopur	Rajnagar	Saraikela- Kharsawan	2014-15	ODF	240	240
17.	Jharkhand	Kalajharna	Rajnagar	Saraikela- Kharsawan	No Award	In- Process	218	207
18.	Jharkhand	Chota Gamharia	Gamharia	Saraikela- Kharsawan	2014-15	ODF	1835	1835



S. No	State	Village	Block	District	Year of attaining ODF status	Status	Number of households	Number of toilets
19.	Jharkhand	Hathinada	Chandil	Saraikela- Kharsawan	2014-15	ODF	130	130
20.	Jharkhand	Kadamdiha	Kharsawan	Saraikela- Kharsawan	2014-15	ODF	403	403
21.	Jharkhand	Chilku	Kharsawan	Saraikela- Kharsawan	No Award	OD	450	15
22.	Jharkhand	Saharjodi	Chandankyari	Bokaro	No Award	In- Process	927	530
23.	Jharkhand	Tatri South	Jaridih	Bokaro	2014-15	ODF	1305	1305
24.	Jharkhand	Kamlapur	Ponda	Bokaro	2014-15	OD	361	337
25.	Jharkhand	Palihari Gurudi	Gomia	Bokaro	2015-16	ODF	826	826
26.	Jharkhand	Parastand	Tundi	Dhanbad	No Award	In- Process	182	63
27.	Jharkhand	Bandih	Tundi	Dhanbad	No Award	OD	35	0
28.	Jharkhand	Salaiya	Tundi	Dhanbad	2014-15	ODF	31	31
29.	Jharkhand	Dumra South	Baghmara	Dhanbad	2014-16	In- Process	746	740
30.	Jharkhand	Kumardih	Govindpur	Dhanbad	No Award	In- Process	512	210
31.	Jharkhand	Dhartichak	Devipur	Deoghar	2015	ODF	52	52
32.	Jharkhand	Pesharpur	Devipur	Deoghar	2015	ODF	42	42
33.	Jharkhand	Ramodi	Devipur	Deoghar	No Award	In- Process	187	150
34.	Jharkhand	Bhoktacharot	Madhupur	Deoghar	2015	ODF	53	53
35.	Jharkhand	Jariatad	Madhupur	Deoghar	No Award	OD	88	45
36.	Jharkhand	Pahadpur	Madhupur	Deoghar	No Award	OD	80	3
37.	Odisha	Badadarda Sahi	Angul	Angul	2015-16	ODF	260	340
38.	Odisha	Kumurisingha	Angul	Angul	2015-16	ODF	1391	1391
39.	Odisha	Shankhapur	Angul	Angul	2015-16	ODF	645	645
40.	Odisha	Sahargoda	Angul	Angul	2015-16	ODF	236	236
41.	Odisha	Gohirapasi	Angul	Angul	2015-16	ODF	38	38



6. Research Observations

Out of 41 villages under study, we found that

- 23 villages have successfully institutionalised the safe defecating practices,
- 7 are in the process of achieving it and
- 11 villages have failed in achieving or sustaining ODF status.

6.1. Factors Behind Successful Institutionalisation of ODF Status

6.1.1. Government Schemes

The government of India has been working towards creating ODF communities since 1954. The central government introduced Central Rural Sanitation Program (CRSP) in 1986. This later evolved to Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC) in 1999. In 2012, TSC was succeeded by Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA).

The current Government, led by Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi, initiated Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM) on 2nd October 2014. With successive schemes, the Government of India (Gol) tried to improvise previous programs and make the mission more effective. The incentive for constructing new toilets have also increased with the progression of the schemes.

6.1.1.1 Swachh Bharat Mission

Under Swachh Bharat Mission, the Gol gives an incentive of Rs. 12,000 to every household to make a new toilet. The emphasis is on toilet construction, behavioural change as well as Solid Liquid Waste Management (SLWM) with community collaboration. In order to reach a large number



A toilet built under TSC still uses a make-shift gate and has no super-structure

of audience, the mission has initiated awareness programme like never before. Moreover, there are specific advantages included in the campaign that makes it better than the previous ones.

Transparency

The Swachh Bharat Mission has laid special emphasis on creating a transparent system. E-Governance has been implemented from the planning to the execution of the program. From planning perspective, Gol has launched the SBMG mobile application. This application gives real-time data of the work done in the programme and the number of villages, gram panchayats and districts that have attained the ODF status.



my SBM app



constructed by beneficiaries

the details and take pictures of the toilet App displaying the vital statistics of the mission

Several agencies are working together for a more transparent fund utilisation at the ground level. The beneficiaries are encouraged to build the toilet themselves and then claim the incentive from the government. To bring transparency in the funds disbursement, direct benefit transfer (DBT) to the beneficiaries' account has been introduced. The beneficiary needs to submit pictures of foundation and final image of the toilet with a duly filled form to claim the incentive amount. To further reduce the chances of any corruption, Block Resource Centre (BRC) executives are empowered with a mobile application to verify the location and ownership of toilet via mobile application

Outreach programmes

It is for the first time ever, when sanitation has acquired the centre stage of the centre's governance agenda. The Prime Minister Narendra Modi kickedoff the mission on Gandhi Jayanti. This proves significance of the mission for the Prime Minister. The outreach program is being propagated through mass media. The Prime Minister also stressed on the toilet adoption in his address to the country in 'Mann Ki Baat'. It



A wall painting displaying the ill effects of open defecation through 'oral fecal cycle' in a school in Saraikela-Kharsawan, Jharkhand



was found that the personal messages of the Prime Minister Narendra Modi have brought sea change in the perception of people and inspired them to construct toilets.

Furthermore, the use of multimedia in the outreach program has been vital. For instance, radio advertisement talking about the importance of toilet and why a bride should be married in a home which has a toilet has struck the right chord in the rural areas. Several instances of *'no toilet-no marriage'* have been observed in Maharashtra and Jharkhand. These campaigns definitely have impacted the conscience of the people.

Moreover, several innovative campaigns such as wall painting, Nukkad Natak (Street Play) and Village meetings have been initiated. The Inter-Personal communication (IPC) executed by officials that included a plethora of activities also encourage people to adopt safe defecating practices.

Good governance innovations that made villages ODF

Several villages have innovated in implementation and introduced praise worthy good governance practices. In the Hiware Bazar, a model village in Ahmednagar district of Maharashtra, when ODF campaign was started by a group of youths, they faced a stiff resistance from others. Then, they shifted their focus to children. They found small children defecated in open because they were afraid of closed toilets. Hence, an innovation in construction of toilets was initiated. The gate of toilets in Anganwadi and primary schools were cut by half, so that children can see through the gate and were not scared. It worked and kids started using these toilets. Consequently, the group started awareness campaign among kids about overall cleanliness and good sanitation practices. This was done in mid 90s. Hiware Bazar is still maintaining the ODF status!

Second model practice was observed in Kolhapur district. Kolhapur has won several awards for its open defecation free villages. It's not easy to convince people to use the toilets, even after constructing them. Though there were enough toilets, some were not comfortable with using them at home and continued to defecate in the open. To solve this problem, "Good Morning campaign" (GMC) was launched in the district. From 5 am to 8 am, a group with musical instruments walked to places where people went for open defecation, ostensibly for practice sessions. They offered roses to those people and requested them to use toilets. It really changed the mindset of some people in Kolhapur.

Third Good Governance innovation describes the work of government officers for making Open Defecation free villages. Swachh Bharat Mission Officials of Multaluka in Chandrapur District, Wardha came up with new initiatives of IEC like pasting Red (No toilet), Green (Working toilet) and Yellow (dysfunctional toilet) stickers on the walls of houses of villages. Psychologically it changed the mindset of people. The officials also distributed 3 types of certificates to villagers like "Praman Patra", "Vinati Patra", "Suchna Patra" for people having toilets, dysfunctional toilets and not having toilets respectively. Officials also started felicitating people who constructed toilet in their houses. Through these initiatives government officials are trying to change the mentality of people.

In Wagdhara, Nagpur district, the baseline survey of 2012 found that 98 families didn't have access to toilets. Even after repetitive efforts to convince people to build toilets, there was a lack of enthusiasm. However, after the announcement of SBM and spirited appeal by PM, people have started constructing toilets with new vigour, taking help of the financial incentive through government schemes. As a result, 30 toilets were constructed till 28 November 2015, and the village became ODF by 31st December, 2015.



Pooling-in of welfare programs

To create a comprehensive umbrella of financial resources to fund the toilet construction, the Gol has found newer ways. The Gol is pooling funds from other welfare programs such as Mahatama Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNREGA) and Namami Gange Abhiyan to fund the toilet construction in several states. The officials are encouraging to utilise the unused funds under local area development (LAD) fund for the purpose of toilet construction. Global funding organisations like GSF and World Bank are funding the awareness and toilet construction in many states. Furthermore, several private agencies are putting-in their efforts through CSR (Corporate Social Responsibility) funds to help the government achieve its goal.



A school toilet built under CSR scheme by National Thermal Power Corporation (NTPC)

6.1.2. Role of Voluntary Organisations

Several voluntary organisations and trusts are

collaborating at various levels for the Swachh Bharat Mission. They are trying to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of the mission.

Global Sanitation Fund (GSF), a funding agency that funds water supply and sanitation initiatives globally, is working with the government of Jharkhand to fast forward the SBM in the state. The GSF has adopted multi-dimensional approach to eliminate open defecation and encourage sanitation habits. It is supporting local voluntary organisations and NGOs to activate and create awareness among the masses. It funds the cost incurred in engaging manpower and organising village level meetings. GSF also works for the capacity building of stake holders. It helps in training of government officials, PRI (Panchayati Raj Institutions) members and activation experts working at the ground level.



Training of PRI members by the team of Global Sanitation Fund

GSF also ensures the reach of quality literature and information at the ground level which can engage audience. It supports wall paintings, and street plays to improve the reach of the IEC campaigns. In Saraikela-Kharsawan district of Jharkhand, GSF has partnered with Integrated Development Fund (IDF) to carry the ground level activation. The work done by IDF was observed in several villages. IDF is collaborating with the district team and is planning the execution of the campaigns for the mission. The activation campaigns have encouraged community participation. IDF has also been executing school rallies, hygiene camps (to promote hand-washing habits among children), wall paintings and street plays.



It is also working for capacity building of Jalsahiya, Village Water and Sanitation Committee (VWSC) members, Panchayati Raj Members and other stake holders.

Several interesting instances where voluntary organisations have succeeded in institutionalising the ODF habits and convincing people for change. In Chota Ghamariya village of Jharkhand, the march towards the ODF status faced several challenges. In one such instance, Tatri Devi, an elderly woman of the village couldn't build the toilet in her home. She had space only towards the entry of the home, which was adjacent to the tribal temple. Understanding the dire need of the toilet, the villagers shifted the temple to a different place and helped the woman to make a toilet.



A wall painting promoting the habit of sanitation created by IDF in collaboration with GSF

In Angul district of Odisha, Feedback Foundation has worked with the communities to activate them at the ground level. During general interaction, people explained the 'oral faecal cycle' in great detail. When enquired about the source of their information, they named the Feedback Foundation and thanked them for information that the families in the village were eating their own faecal matter. The cleanliness was not only evident in the defecating practices but was also evident in overall sanitation practice.

6.1.3. Leadership

Every successful model village was driven by leadership at some level, whether it was spiritual, political or social.

Driven by Popatrao Pawar's leadership skills, Hiware Bazar village of Ahmednagar district in Maharashtra has successfully institutionalised the ODF practice for over two decades. Till 1989, Hiware Bazar was one of the most notorious villages in Ahmednagar district. Most of the public welfare schemes never reached the needy. Young Popatrao was elected Sarpanch in 1989 and the journey of the village towards its transformation started. His work towards improving lives of people started with his movement towards making the village clean. Nonetheless, it was not an easy task, he had to change the mindset of the people. In order to convince the entire village, Popatrao formed a group of young people and started his campaign against open defecation. He would repeatedly request people to make toilets and would offer to provide them the financial assistance through micro-finance institutions. After repeated failed efforts, he started picking

Closed his own liquor shop

Chandu Patil is the ex-Sarpanch of Rajgarh in Mul block of Chandrapur District. He is the pioneer of sanitation movement in the district. While he was the Sarpanch of the village, he encouraged the village to adopt clean defecating habits and successfully achieved the ODF status. However, he was unhappy by the fact that alcohol was reducing the prosperity of his village. Ironically, his family owned a liquor shop in the village. Realising the harm it was doing to the village, he convinced his family to shut down the liquor shop. He later moved to agro-processing to take care of the bread and butter of his family.

the faeces with his own hand and throw it in dustbin. The action embarrassed people and thus initiated his movement towards changing the mindset. Pawar knew that for changing habit next generation would have to be trained. Soon, he shifted his focus from elderly to school children. He trained and taught the school children, the importance of sanitation. As a result, these young ambassadors started to force their parents and family elders to stop defecating in open.



In Jharkhand, the sanitation movement has been led by Jalsahiya at the ground level. It was observed at several instances that the leadership of the Jalsahiya helped the village institutionalise ODF success. In Chota Ghamariya village of the Saraikela-Kharsawan District in Jharkhand, Jalsahiya - Manmati Mahto was pivotal in making her village open defecation free. She was one of the early adopter of the toilet in the village. She tirelessly met families to convince them to adopt clean defecating practices.

Another interesting leadership instance was witnessed in Kolhapur district of Maharashtra. Bharat (Appa) Patil was elected Block President of Kolhapur Jila Parishad in 1995. He started his work in sanitation with awareness drive in 111 Gram Panchayats of his block. He went to every village to educate people on the importance of clean sanitation habits. Leveraging to the fact that it is embarrassing for

Jalsahiya

The state has introduced a special initiative to ease the work at the ground level. A 'Jalsahiya' (or water caretaker) is elected in every panchayat. She acts as the nodal officer for drinking water and sanitation department in the panchayat. She also takes care of the awareness and toilet construction works of SBM at the panchayat level.

The sanitation movement has been led by Jalsahiya at the ground level in Jharkhand. It was observed at several instances where the leadership of the Jalsahiya helped village to institutionalise the ODF habits in the state.

women to defecate in open, Appa modified his awareness drive into 'Mahilaon ki Gram Sabha' (village assembly for women). To ensure good attendance at the Gram Sabha, he used to conduct it at religious places. For women, the stigma involved in defecating in open and the inability to go to the toilet during the day time helped in creating a larger impact for his awareness drive. He gradually shifted his focus to school children and initiated engaging activities. A 'Prabhat Feri' (morning march) which involved children taking a march across the village with sanitation placards helped raise the awareness level. He also gave the responsibility of maintaining sanitation to children. People started to keep their locality clean after realising that it was their child's duty to clean the garbage that they would create.

However, he failed to convince a section of society who saw things through political prism or were reluctant to adopt clean defecating methods even after repetitive efforts. In order to deal with them, he adopted an innovative campaign. He took help of district administration who registered over 4500 FIRs against people who defecated in the public place. Appa also adopted innovative cultural methods for convincing people to make toilets. During Ganesh Pooja, the lady who leads Gauri Pravesh would talk about making toilets. Her intervention led to large scale awareness on the issue.

One interesting example of spiritual leadership observed during the research is from Kolhapur district in Maharashtra. Kad Siddheshwar Swami of Kaneri Math emerged as the driving force behind the development of Shelkewadi as a model village. With the vision from Swami ji, villagers adopted sustainable ways to achieve prosperity. Every home in the village has built toilets fitted with Bio-gas plant. Thus, they do not need additional gas cylinder for cooking. The village is LPG free because of the biogas produced from these plants.



Children taking 'Prabhat Feri' or morning march to spread awareness about sanitation in Dhamangaon - Wathoda



Bureaucratic leadership has played a pivotal role in the implementation of various welfare schemes at the ground level. The research found two specific instances where intervention by bureaucratic leadership succeeded in bringing about tremendous change.

Spiritual motivation

Spiritual motivation is observed to be an important reason that inspired villages for adopting sanitation practices and achieving ODF status. Shelkewadi village near Kanherimath, Taluka – Karveer, Dist.– Kolhapur is an ODF village. All families in the village use Biogas-toilets for sustainable energy usage. However, before 2005, the village practiced open defecation. Kadhsiddheshwar Swamiji of Kanherimath adopted this village in 2005. His spiritual teachings and motivation for adopting clean defecating practice has inspired every person in the village. The villagers, being ardent follower of Swamiji, have heartedly followed his every instruction. Another interesting fact about the village is that every piece of land is named after the women of the household. Moreover, every home bears the name of females in the family, on its nameplate. They are using solar panels in street lights. No child of the village is malnourished. Children are taught cultural and moral values in Kanherimath along with their school. This village is an interesting case study of a village developed by a spiritual leader.

Citizen of Sirsoli village, in Ashtitaluka of Wardha district are followers of Sant Tukdoji Maharaj. It is 100% Open Defecation free village and completely clean. The village is also a dispute free village. 100% children in this village are going to school. A fascinating fact about the village is that the entire village wakes up at 5 AM and assembles to perform Yoga in the village's temple. Subsequently, they meet to discuss challenges and problems faced in the village and its possible solution. They disperse to perform daily chores and meet again in the evening. Prior to evening meeting, daily cleaning of the village and collective prayers is performed. "This happens because every villager is a follower of Tukdoji Maharaj and reads Gram Geeta daily. Everyone is spiritually connected with sanitation" said Ex Sarpanch Rewashakar.

Bharat Appa Patil, a social worker from Panhala block of Kolhapur district and his team pioneered innovations to change the mindset of people. They leveraged religious festivals to spread the message of sanitation. For instance, they executed street plays on importance of constructing toilets during Ganesh Pooja (Ganesh Festival). They requested religious leaders to speak about open defecation and toilet construction after the katha (story). Another successful innovation leveraging cultural cue involves invoking the person who performed rituals to talk about toilet construction. "On the night of 2nd day of "Ganesh Utsav" some women are believed to be in touch with Goddess "Gauri", the team approached such women and requested her to talk about toilet construction after the rituals. It made a deep impact and the awareness about the issue received a boost.

In Angul District of Odisha, the Ex-District Magistrate (DM), Sachin Jadhav played a pivotal role in ushering a social change and helped over 110 villages to become Open Defecation Free.

Similar instance was observed in Wardha district of Maharashtra. Ashutosh Salil, District Magistrate (DM), Wardha personally used to take regular updates on the development of the SBM campaign and its implementation. In order to ease the communication process, the officials were leveraging instant messaging



A woman showing the biogas based cooking system in Shelkewadi



applications. They created groups of implementing officials including SBM - ABDO (Swachh Bharat Mission - Assistant Block Development Officers), CEOs (chief executive officers), Gram Sevaks, Sarpanch and other stake holders, to ensure pace of work.

6.1.4. Innovation

The research observed several Out-of-the-box ideas and innovations in implementation of various schemes.

Hiware Bazar turned to schools and Anganwadis to create sanitation awareness among the youngsters. Children were encouraged to adopt the practice of defecating in toilets. However, children in Anganwadis were scared to go to toilet with closed door. The problem thus required an out-ofthe-box strategy. Thus toilets with doors partially made of nets were prepared. The door allowed the children to look outside and see surroundings while defecating. The door had a steel base approximately one foot high and a net above it. The children were encouraged to go to the toilet and they were not afraid in doing so. Gohira Pasi village of Bedasasan Block in Angul, Odisha; a plumber - Vikas Chandra innovated in the design of toilet to ensure tap water in the newly constructed toilets of the village.

Under the guidelines of SBM, a water tank is to be built adjoining the toilet. Yet, in most of the villages, it is not connected to the tap inside the toilet. Hence, one has to carry the water to the toilet in a bucket filled from the tank. In the new model innovated by Vikas, the platform of the water container is raised so that the bottom of the tank can be connected directly to the toilet. This ensures the water supply till the last drop of the water in the tank. The local innovations in the toilet structures has encouraged the use of toilet amongst locals.

The Rajgarh village of Maharashtra implemented an interesting style for encouraging toilet usage among children. They have made cartoons on the walls of toilets in Anganwadi and school toilet. The beautifully crafted and clean toilets convince children adopt a habit of defecating in them.



A toilet in Hiware Bazar with partially covered gate



An elevated water tank connected to the tap, an innovation to ensure tapped water supply in Angul, Odisha

Administrative innovation was also observed in the working of the government of Jharkhand. The state has introduced a special initiative to ease the work at the ground level. A 'Jalsahiya' (or water caretaker) is elected in every panchayat. She acts as the nodal officer for drinking water and sanitation department in the panchayat.



She is also taking care of the awareness and toilet construction work of SBM at the panchayat level. It is being learnt that Jalsahiya helped solving several implementation challenges of the programme locally. In one such instance, villager Sumitra Sardar faced space constraint when she planned to construct the toilet in her home. The temple of her home was at the centre of the house and there was no space left to construct toilet. Mrs. Mahto convinced her to build the toilet adjoining temple. She encouraged the belief that the toilet is the place which helps the person to become clean, similar to what a temple does. With the support of fellow villagers, Sumitra Sardar finally built a toilet. Mahto also ensured tapped water connection to every household in the village through the drinking water and sanitation department.



Cartoons in the kids' toilet to encourage a habit of using toilet in Rajgarh Village, Maharashtra

The research observed that majority of the toilets built in rural areas were because of the push received by the SBM Campaign. Several underprivileged families were now proud owners of a toilet. The mission has impacted remote corners of the country too.

The mission also resulted in several indirect benefits. Many gained employment because of the mission. Many others are earning their livelihood by selling infrastructure needed to construct a toilet. As a matter of fact, the rapid increase in the speed of toilet construction has resulted in acute deficiency of mason and technicians who can construct toilets. Hence, as a part of local initiative, villagers of Maharashtra and Jharkhand gave mason training too. Furthermore, several self help groups (SHGs) are helping businesses to manufacture bricks and other related materials, which can speed up the toilet construction process and enhance livelihood.

In Hathinada village of Chandil Block in Saraikela-Kharsawan of Jharkhand, the villagers wanted to construct a toilet. Located in the middle of a hill and dense forest, there was no mason or trained labour for the construction of the toilet, even in nearby villages. Integrated Development Fund (IDF), a voluntary organisation working with the government of Jharkhand to promote safe defecating habits, gave mason training to 20 villagers and built 20 toilets while training them. Thus, they helped build 20 toilets with almost no mason cost. The step has not only improved skills of the villagers, it has also helped them gain alternate employment. Also, the organisation gave training in brick manufacturing. Soon, the villagers engaged themselves in making bricks locally. This reduced the cost of toilet and helped locals financially.

Several villages have innovated ways of reducing the cost of the toilet at the community level. In Angul district of Odisha, the locals formed a 'Procurement Committee' and collectively procured the raw materials required to make the toilet. It helped them in bargaining a good discount. Similar practice was adopted in several villages of Maharashtra including Hiware Bazar, Mohare, Ambawade, Salwan and Rajgarh.

Since, the incentive of Rs. 12,000 is provided only after construction of toilet, several villagers who couldn't afford to pay in advance adopted a different tactic. They paid their share by loans from cooperatives, banks or SHGs and returned the amount after it was credited to their account. Such a practice was prevalent in majority of villages in Maharashtra that succeeded in institutionalising ODF habits.



6.1.5. Trigger Campaigns

The biggest challenge Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM) faces is institutionalising the ODF habits. Chandu Patil, Ex-Sarpanch, Rajgarh, Chandrapur District in Maharashtra states, "the mission to create ODF villages is beyond making toilets, it is about changing mindsets and behaviour of the people."

Information, education and communication (IEC) campaigns are instrumental to the SBM's objective to make India clean by 2019. As much as 8% of the entire SBM budget is allocated towards designing and executing IEC campaigns. 3% of it is spent by the central government and 5% is allocated to be spent in local activations. In rural areas, these campaigns have majorly triggered the use and need of toilets^{xx}.



Wall paintings by government promoting cleanliness through IEC

'There are various evidences of people defecating in open even when they own toilets in the villages where the institutionalisation attempts have failed. The reasons often cited are - mindset that the toilet is not necessary and the habit of going in open. Changing such practices require a behavioural change which can only be sustained by continuous effort. All the villages that still continue to be ODF have adopted some kind of campaign that still continues to spread the awareness about sanitation. For institutionalisation of ODF, as much as 100 follow-ups are required' said Sachin Jadhav, Ex-DM, Angul, Odisha.

To create sustainable awareness, the officials use several 'triggers' that can create the sudden need and urgency to use toilets. The impact of triggers was different in different communities. For instance, the invoking of 'embarrassment' was very impactful in semi-urban and non-tribal areas. In such campaigns, the activation experts talked about, how embarrassing it was for a woman to go to the open field. They added that the females avoid going to toilet in the daylight and the dark hours are unsafe and distressful.

In tribal areas, the knowledge of 'Oral faecal Cycle' has helped to spread the need of using a toilet. In such triggers, the activation experts call for a village meeting. Then they work together to create a village map with details of homes, water bodies and farms. Consequently, they enquire and mark the location where the families defecate in open. They use this knowledge to inform how the faeces enter their food cycle. This invokes disgust and convinces them that the families face disease because of defecating in open. Hence, villagers are sufficiently convinced on the need to use toilets.

Furthermore, several other triggers are run to convince the urgent need of adopting clean



The practice of sanitation and cleanliness is imbibed in children (A picture of a classroom in Rajgarh)



defecating practice. A trigger executed in several parts of Maharashtra and Jharkhand tries to invoke the 'disgust' among communities. People from village administration used to gather young people of the village at a location. Later, the team would march to the place in the village where people generally go to defecate, often called 'Hagandari'. The leader of the campaign would bring a bottle of mineral water and a glass with him. He would pour in a glass of water and drink in front of everyone. He would then ask others to drink the same. He would then pick a strand of hair and dip on the faeces already present around. He would then dip the same strand in the glass of water and ask people to drink the water. The action invoked disgusted reactions and a message against open defecation was communicated. They would be convinced that the practise of open defecation is carrying the faeces to the food they eat and the water they drink. The leader would also demonstrate that the rain water mixed in the sewage from hagandari is going to the sources of drinking water and how they have been drinking the same contaminated water.

Often, the result of these triggers invoke the urge of adopting safe defecating practice. Villagers ask for makeshift arrangements until the toilet construction is over. In Sahargoda village of Angul district in Odisha, similar challenge was felt. The voluntary organisation working in the region suggested villagers to adopt several makeshift arrangements until the toilets are made. This includes *'Cat Method'* among others. In Cat method, the families with no toilets are suggested to dig a 30 cm deep pit and defecate and cover the same with soil immediately. Others were suggested to use a nearby toilet, located in neighboring homes, religious places, Anganwadis or in the village schools. These kinds of interventions ensured relatively safer sanitation practice as proposed during the triggering sessions till construction of permanent toilets.

Interventions by spiritual leaders have played a vital role in places where the direct intervention by the administration also failed to bring change in the habits. Spiritual leader Kad Siddheshwar Swami encouraged villages to build toilets and adopt healthy habits. He emphasised on using toilets during various religious and social events. Shelkewadi village in Kolhapur district of Maharashtra follows Swami Ji religiously. During the study, it was observed that the village institutionalised ODF practices following the teachings of Swami Ji. Another interesting fact about the village is that they consider sanitation as auspicious and the entire village has a daily habit of making Rangoli at their doorsteps.

In Wardha, Maharashtra, various Orchestra groups were called to create special awareness drive throughout the district. The group would go to villages, use music and street play to attract villagers. The play would soon become infotainment from entertainment. The play would appeal use of toilets and other good practices to keep the village clean.

Sirsoli village in Aashti block, Wardha, Maharashtra is another example of how the communities institutionalise sanitation. Inspired from the teachings of Sant Gadage Baba in early 1980s, a local spiritual leader successfully institutionalised behavioural change. The village has evolved a unique culture which has inculcated sanitation as part of their value system. It conducts monthly cleanliness festival accompanied by awareness drive. It is interesting to note that the entire village collectively cleans their neighbourhood and engage everyone in community prayers and yoga, daily.



A picture of monthly cleanliness festival in Sisoli village



The awareness drive has been modified depending on the demography. In Wardha, awareness drives faced a unique challenge. Most of the women and men work on their farms throughout the day. Thus, engaging villagers in inter-personal communication was not possible during the normal work hours. Zila Administration tackled this issue by conducting '*Raat ki Sabha*' (night assembly) in villages. In order to establish a bond with the audience, they started meeting people after 6 PM and convinced them for constructing toilets at home. They also convinced local leaders like Patwari, Gram Sevak and Group secretary to join such sabhas, which made them even more engaging.



Pehle Shauchalaya, Fir Devalaya A toilet constructed in the place of a temple in Kingaon

Various districts also adopted a unique way of felicitating every such village who has recently achieved ODF status. They would reward and recognise the leaders of such villages during the meeting of Zila Parishad and would encourage them to celebrate the same in their village. The same event would then serve as a reminder to the villages who still defecate in open.

Another style to encourage and spread awareness among people is by invoking Pride. In Maharashtra, everyone takes pride as belonging to the land of Shivaji. Perhaps, every household has a picture of Shivaji. Campaigns leveraging this pride about legacy have been initiated in Konkan and Kolhapur region. Every village or region with any historical connection with Shivaji was reminded of the heritage they possess.

One such instance shared by Bharat (Appa) Patil, Ex Zila Parishad head is - 'we would start our campaign by saying, you belong to the land where Veer Shivaji once walked during the war. If Shivaji would be here today, he would be very unhappy to see that this village still defecating on his motherland. People who are going in open are maligning the land of Shivaji. Let's live the legend of Veer Shivaji and make ourselves ODF.'

This appeal worked like a magic and several people joined the mission.

6.1.6. Sanitation as a Social Norm

The mission doesn't only target the individual household toilet construction, it also emphasises adoption of toilet usage as part of the social practise. It targets to make the toilet ownership as aspirational.

Monetary rewards and constant campaigns have played a role of a catalyst in the process. Even so, despite winning rewards and being declared ODF, several villages failed in institutionalising the ODF habits. Soon after the rewards, some villages started defecating in open.

Hence, it is evident that the villages which successfully institutionalised the practices have



A certificate designed in Chandrapur district to felicitate people who have recently constructed toilet

18

ensured a sustainable strategy. In such villages, it was noted that certain means of incentivising and constant encouragement was provided. Such non-monetary rewards were given to people who continued the practice of keeping the village clean.

Sirsoli, in Aashti Block of Wardha district in Maharashtra successfully created a culture of sanitation. The entire village meets twice for prayers. Each prayer is followed by a collective cleaning of the entire village. Since everyone has to clean their home twice, they refrain from even throwing a trash in the neighborhood.

Chota Ghamariya village in Saraikela-Kharsawan district of Jharkhand has successfully institutionalised the practise. During the study, it was noted that after achieving the ODF status, the village team worked to bring tapped water connection to every household. It started with an individual initiative. Although, the village wanted to use toilet, it was difficult for them to carry water from tubewell and then use it. Understanding the problem faced by the village, Jalsahiya requested the officials of the Drinking Water department to help in providing tap water connection in the village. With local participation and regular follow-ups, the village was provided with the benefits of scheme and every household currently has a tapped water connection. The people of the village perceive water connection as the reward of keeping the village clean. Hence, the villagers ensure that every house keeps the neighbourhood clean and defecates only in their homes.

Administration of Chandrapur and Wardha district attempted to institutionalise the habit by adopting unique annual felicitation programme. In an annual meeting with the officials, families which continue to use toilet and keep their surrounding clean are recognised by appreciation letters and certificates. These letters signify the fact that they are responsible citizens and have contributed towards creating ODF communities. People who have recently built toilets are felicitated during several other social events, thus encouraging others to construct the toilet for them.

6.1.7. Public Partnership

Public partnership is yet another common factor amongst villagers which helps institutionalise ODF practice.

Every individual of the village is involved in the decision making process and the projects in the village have been a collaborative work of government and public.

The state of Jharkhand has made innovation in public administration to promote the public participation in the sanitation mission. The mission in the state faced challenges in implementation of the program because of the wide-spread poverty in the state. The SBM directive states that the Rs. 12,000 for toilet construction shall be paid after the beneficiary has constructed the toilet and submitted the photographs with concerned authorities. However, the widespread poverty was a challenge and the villagers were not able to make toilets on their own. In order to find solution to the problem, the state created Village Water and Sanitation Committees (VWSC) at the Panchayat



Gram sansad in Hiware Bazar is the place where all the collective decision is made



level. The 7-member committee looked after the construction of toilets in the panchayat. The members were elected locally and included both Mukhiya and Jalsahiya. The money for the toilet construction was received by the committee and the committee used to credit the beneficiary with required amount in phases. In several villages, the committee helped in the procurement in bulk and helped families in better construction of toilets.

A similar approach was adopted by Angul, Odisha. 'Procurement Committee' was created, which involved local individuals. They not only procured in bulk for toilet construction, they also helped in construction of the toilet at the community level.

During research in Hiware Bazar, Ahmednagar district, Maharashtra, a similar concept was observed. Every project or initiative that happened in the village was under the purview of village Panchayat. The village panchayat appointed a committee of villagers who took the onus to mentor and support the projects under execution. This ensured that no money of the project is lost in corruption and the village achieves result in the best possible quality. The village panchayat ensured that every household invests some amount of money in making toilet and utilises other schemes of government, so that the village has a feeling of ownership.

Rajgarh and Kingaon in Maharashtra also present similar instances. The village collectively build toilets to reduce the cost of toilet construction. Also, they ensured that every citizen contributes in labour and in kind. The villagers also built drainage, roads and Gram Panchayat building collectively. Thus the villagers take pride and maintain well every infrastructure they have built.

Several villages adopted different ways to encourage public participation in the process of creating and sustaining ODF village. One of the major initiatives taken in this direction was the organise painting competitions based on sanitation in schools. Several villages in Maharashtra, Jharkhand and Odisha adopted this tactic to make children a stake holder in the campaign. The paintings by the children are later used as content to promote the idea of clean defecation in villages.

The research observed that people participation was also pivotal in role of monitoring committees. Several villages which achieved ODF status had appointed Monitoring committee of people of different communities. These individuals regularly monitored and ensured that the individuals continue to follow safe defecating habits.

6.1.8. Availability of Water in Toilets

The availability of water near toilet is one of the conditions to ensure that people start using toilet. Every village that successfully institutionalised ODF success ensured the presence of water near the toilet.

In Jharkhand's Hathinada village of Chandil block, the villagers were initially reluctant to use toilets. Even after the construction of toilets in the village, people were not willing to use them. They constantly argued that they had to carry the water to the toilet; instead it was easier for them to go in open. Hence, as soon as the villagers succeeded in constructing toilet in every household, they focused on bringing tapped drinking water. The village successfully constructed a water tank and ensured tapped water supply within six months. The observations in the village suggested that the village successfully institutionalised the safe defecating habits because of the water supply.

Similarly in Pimpalgaon - Wadala of Maharashtra, as soon as any village achieved 100% household toilet construction, the villagers started working on ensuring tapped water supply. It is observed that the lack of water supply was one of the main reasons there that was stopping people in using a toilet.



Kingaon in Aurangabad district of Maharashtra also presented an interesting case study. The village and its adjoining areas come under Marathwada region of the state. The region had been facing drought situation for some years now. Thus, life and economy of the region was adversely affected by the condition. The sanitation movement also suffered huge setback. In the previous five years, the village had concentrated on watershed management. In this endeavour, the village had collectively constructed check dams around all the major water bodies of the village. The check dam had helped in containing the rain water in the village. As a result, every individual household had a source of water adjoining to their house. This made it easier to carry water to home and thus ensure toilet usage as a social norm.

6.1.9. Holistic Approach

Every successful model exhibited that it had gone beyond toilet usage and attempted to create a more prosperous society. Hence, the institutionalisation of sanitation and prosperity were correlated.

Hiware Bazar presents one such model in which the village has gone beyond building toilets. The village faced several droughts in early 1990s. The villagers had to move to other villages for jobs during summer season. The challenge was to retain water for farming around the year. They adopted several water shed management practices. This include making check dams, using drip irrigation among others. In a few years, the water table improved drastically, making water available even when there was a severe drought in nearby villages. The village leadership encouraged people to cultivate crops requiring less water and the practice of crop rotation leading to improved agriculture income. The overall improvement in the quality of life was achieved which led to institutionalisation of ODF success.



Hiware Bazar, with the help of water shed management has gained green cover

Education of prospects is one of the common factors found in almost all of the model villages. Local leadership in several villages emphasised on imparting quality education and include value based education in the system. They encouraged children to become active promoters of the sanitation movement so that the practice gets imbibed in the society.

Farming is the backbone of village economy; hence, adoption of planned and scientific farming is yet another method of creating prosperous society. Several villages have adopted the practice of soil testing before sowing seeds. They have started to plan the crops in the village depending on the availability of water and other resources, e.g. Hiware Bazar banned cultivation of sugar cane in order to maintain the water table in the village.

Shelkewadi village in Karveer Block of Kolhapur district collectively adopted organic farming to improve the crop yield. Thus the village reduced dependence on fertilisers and other synthetic means of crop improvement and also saving some money. In order to improve the finances locally, every household in the village



reared cattle and collectively sold dairy products in the village collection centre. The village also ensures participation of every individual in cleaning and maintaining the sanitation.

6.2. Villages that Failed to Institutionalise the ODF Habits

Several factors contributed to the failure in the attempts of institutionalising ODF habit. The major factors observed behind this failure are listed below.:

6.2.1. Political Resistance and Leadership Challenge

During the study in villages which failed to institutionalise ODF habits, 'Political resistance' and dissonance was observed as common reason in almost all of them. The desire and habit to disown the work done by opponent leader has been the major contributing factor.

Politics behind ODF villages

Most of the villages have given "Politics" as one of the major reasons for success or failure of ODF initiatives in their villages. The village leadership was involved in the promotion of safe defecation habit with a mere target of winning the SGBGSA (Sant Gadage Baba Gram Swachhta Abhiyaan). Such leadership tried to convince and at times made toilets from their own funds to make the village ODF. However, after winning the award, they ignored any didn't put any further effort to continue the ODF status.

In others, the SGBGSA became the reason of non cooperation and resistance. People didn't adopt clean defecating habits only because it was being promoted by opposite political party.

In another political instance, a group tried to malign the work of the leader to stop him from achieving SGBGSA. In one such instance, in Kingaon of Phulambri Taluka in Aurangabad district, during the visit of the monitoring team of SGBGSA, a member of the opposite party tried to spill dirt in open with an attempt to malign the leader's candidature for the award.

In another observation, the leadership in Virai in Mul Taluka of Chandarpur, the leadership received SGBGSA three times in a row. However, after the transfer of power to the new leadership in 2007, the newly elected leadership shifted its focus away from sanitation. They even dissolved the monitoring committee to dilute the power of others in the village. Hence, for pity political gains, sanitation movement was stalled. The research team found that all the public toilets in the village were no more functional and according to the village leadership, 80% of the villagers defecates in open.

The failure to inspire people and political strife among leaders were the two main factors contributing to the political dissonance.

The leaders failed to inspire people at many occasions. In Jharkhand, Mukhiya and Jalsahiya were expected to work towards the sanitation. Support from other leaders relating to PRI (Panchayati Raj Institute) was also expected. However, some of them were either indifferent to the issue or didn't want to pursue it. In Kamalapur village, Ponda Block of Bokaro district in Jharkhand, the Sarpanch and Jalsahiya failed to inspire people. While investigating the issue, it was found that both of the local leaders failed to construct the toilet in their own homes. Hence, they failed to inspire other villagers for the cause.



Swachhta beyond politics

Bharat (Appa) Patil, Ex-Block president, Kolhapur Jila Parishad was extremely motivated to make the block ODF. He convinced leaders from various parties to go beyond politics and take up the cause of sanitation. However, political tussle played havoc in his work to accomplish the target. In one such instance, a leader of one of the village was reluctant to construct a toilet in his home. Appa, at several instance, tried to meet him. Nevertheless, he would ignore a face-off and wouldn't even listen what Appa had to say. One day, frustrated Appa surprised him by a visit in his home at 5 AM. He didn't leave the leader's home even after repetitive requests. He convinced the leader to use the toilet and even accompanied him to buy the materials for constructing one.

In Maharashtra, the SGBGSA (Sant Gadage Baba Gram Swachhta Abhiyaan), award was given to the village leadership. Hence, there was a political strife between leaders who wanted to clean up their village on one side and leaders who opposed their success on the other side. Awards and recognition became the reason of non cooperation and political resistance.

6.2.2. Frequent Policy Changes

At several occasions, a minor deviation from given policy or utilising small loopholes in the system has drastically derailed the movement for creating ODF villages.



Incomplete work due to political resistance

Notably, the negative impact of regular revision of incentives for making toilets was a common reason in most of the villages. Central Rural Sanitation Programme (CRSP) was the pioneer of the movement creating ODF villages followed by Nirmal Bharat Abhiyaan (NBA) and then Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC). The initial incentive received by BPL families under the CRSP was Rs. 500. Thousands of families built toilets under the scheme. Later, the incentive was revised to Rs. 1500 and the non BPL families were also brought under the scheme. The movement also succeeded and the speed of toilet construction increased tremendously. In order to further boost the speed and adoption, Gol increased the incentives to Rs. 2500 which was gradually increased to 10,000. The SBM is currently incentivising the toilet construction by Rs. 12,000. The constant revision of the incentive has made a negative impact on the mentality of the people. During research, several families interviewed about the reason for still not constructing the toilet replied that they were waiting for the next revision. They added that they felt skeptical that the government will increase the incentive amount and they would lose money if they built the toilet at this stage.



Another policy issue that was found during the study was the lack of incentive to maintain the toilets. Families, which had constructed toilets earlier with the help of government scheme, were not able to maintain it due to poverty. The current policies do not allow people to take the benefit of the sanitation scheme for the second time. The study found that the toilet constructed during CRSP with the incentive of Rs. 500 were basic i.e. the construction quality was below average. Thus these toilets have become dysfunctional and the current policy has no scope to reconstruct them.

During the visit in Jariatad village in Madhupur block of Deoghar district in Jharkhand, a large number of families live in homes built on encroached land and the homes didn't have access to toilets. Since, there is no incentive for toilet construction on encroached land, no financial help has been provided to them. Similar issues were also found in some villages of Maharashtra as well.

In another instance, in Bandi village of Tundi Block in Dhanbad district, the villagers wanted to construct toilets, however, since the village does not come under the Annual Implementation Plan (AIP) of the district, no financial help could be provided.

Annual implementation plan (AIP) was created to make the villages ODF in phase wise manner. The villages coming under AIP are given priority and the IEC campaigns are targeted there to convince individuals to use toilets. However, there are villages and families, outside the AIP, who wanted to construct toilets immediately and are told that they shall not be provided any incentive. Thus, they were discouraged.



A toilet made from government funds under CRSP in Pimpalgaon. The toilet is dysfunctional currently



Open Defecation in front of a community toilet in Virai

6.2.3. Rigid Mindsets

The villages which were once ODF and have failed to maintain the status, signify the lack of continued focus towards changing mindsets.

The SBM is advocating the twin-pit structure of making toilets. In the current norm, the beneficiary needs to make 2 pits, 3 feet deep. The 3 feet deep pit allows the growth of micro-organisms in the pit that would decay



the faeces and convert it into compost. However, the officials are facing huge challenge of convincing the same to the beneficiaries. It was observed that there was a common belief that the toilet pit would be filled within a short time. Thus, individuals either spend too much in making deeper pit or would not use the toilet, fearing that it may be filled quickly.

Another major challenge that reflects the mindset issue is the lack of public interest in talking about the subjects relating to open defecation. The study observed that it is still considered a taboo in several villages. The need to adopt clean defecation habits is not discussed as an



Public participation - The villager in Dhamangaon, who lives in a hut, has built a concrete toilet with the help of Rs. 12,000 from SBM funds

important issue at any social or political event. In fact, the need of toilet as a social norm has not yet been established, in certain areas of the country and segments of the society.

In some areas, building and owning a toilet is not yet perceived as aspirational. In interviews with the people not owning a toilet, it came out that people did not feel the need. They argued that there was no social appreciation for making a toilet. In villages, which had constructed toilets earlier and don't use it currently, argue that they don't feel an urge to use them, they constructed toilets for the sake of winning awards.

There were some intriguing findings relating to the mindset of people. Several villages consider making toilets as government's responsibility. While interviewing families which still don't own toilets, in Virai village of Mul block in Chardarpur district, it was found that people considered toilet construction to be similar to road or dam construction. Furthermore, the mentality was prevalent not only among the poor or illiterate people, but also among the educated and rich families.

The target of cultivating clean sanitation habits also faces cultural challenges. Several villages were reluctant to build toilets at first place. In Chandpur village of Chanderpur district, they argued that it is considered inauspicious to have toilet within the premises of the house, as it may bring diseases and destroy crops.

The study found that the villages which failed to institutionalise ODF also struggled in changing the old habits of elderly and cultivating the habit among children. During interviews, the elderly often argued that they had defecated in open throughout their lives and it was not possible for them to suddenly adopt new habits. The parents of children argued that the children were scared of the closed door and darkness in the toilet. Consequently, both children and elderly defecate in open.

Open defecation is also considered as a social norm in some villages. Some women in villages were reluctant to use toilets at home. They argued that they utilise the time when they defecate in open to socialise with other women from the village. The closed system and daily household chores did not allow them to do so at other times. Thus, they would not encourage the construction of toilets in their homes.



Making Villages Open Defecation Free

6.2.4. Lack of Regular Monitoring

Lack of monitoring is another reason for failure. It was especially true in the schools and Anganwadi Toilets. In Jharkhand, majority of the school toilets were not usable. When enquired about the reasons, it was observed that there was no monitoring done either at school level or at the administrative level. These toilets lack tapped water connection, were unclean, and thus unusable.

People from the villages, which were declared ODF, had worked for years to achieve the status. The process, in most of the villages, involved a group of people (often led by Sarpanch or Gram Sevak) monitoring every small step in the direction of creating ODF society. These groups also took care that no relapse would happen and encouraged people to shed grievances peacefully amongst themselves. The committees convinced villagers to cultivate healthy sanitation habits.

She sold her 'Mangalsootra' for a toilet

The research observed several poignant stories linked to the campaign against open defecation. These individual contributions laid the foundation of sanitation in the state of Maharashtra.

Anita Tai Dukre of Pimpalgaon – Wadala in Aarvi block of Wardha district wanted to construct a toilet inspired her home. She was upset and embarrassed to defecate in the open when the entire village was subsequently constructing toilets. However, her family faced extreme financial crunch and the toilet construction was beyond the family budget. She took a tough decision and sold her 'Mangalsootra' (a jewelry gifted to the bride on her marriage) to make a toilet. She inspired several families to build toilets.

After giving awards to ODF villages, the authorities diverted their attention from them. It was assumed that the rewarded villages have already developed the consciousness about sanitation and have cultivated clean defecating habits. Consequently, there was no further monitoring of such villages.

There was absence of an established mechanism to follow up if the villages already rewarded still practice clean defecating habits. Additionally, the monitoring committees within the village that led the entire movement and encouraged people to adopt clean defecating habits, would also withdraw after winning awards. Therefore, institutionalisation attempts failed in these villages.

6.2.5. Poverty and Resource Constraint

Several leaders interviewed pointed out that poverty was an important reason for the failure of institutionalisation of the ODF. Conversely, there were several leaders who argued that poverty was just an excuse.

The incentive of Rs. 12,000 for constructing toilets is given after the construction of toilets. But, poor families do not have sufficient resources to start constructing toilets at first place.

Another financial challenge observed in some villages was an issue with Direct Benefit transfer. Villagers who got toilet constructed from a contractor were unable to pay them back because they already had a bank loan in their account. The amount transferred from the government was deducted from the bank in lieu of the loan they possess.

Several families willing to construct toilets have failed to do so because of the lack of space in their houses. Families in villages like Kingaon village in Phulambri district of Maharashtra argued that most of the homes in


the village are so small that they were unable to accommodate the space for a toilet. The problem is especially prevalent in the Marathwada region of Maharashtra and North Jharkhand.

6.2.6. Lack of Motivation and Capacity Building

Lack of enthusiasm among the officials handling the work of SBM has also been one of the key reasons for failure. The Mission demands repeated follow ups, and it is very difficult for an official to match proposed time table with actual execution at the ground level.

How reinvented efforts has helped this village to become ODF again

Pimpalgaon – Wadala in Aaarvi Block of Wardha district was declared ODF and won SGBGSA in 2001-2. However, lack of follow up, monitoring and focus towards sanitation made people ignorant about the issue. Toilets maintenance was completely ignored. Consequently, the practice of open defecation restarted. In 2012, 89 of the 284 households didn't have a functional toilet.

Nevertheless, Gol renewed its effort towards making clean and open defecation free villages. Numerous communication campaigns including TV ads, radio ads, Street play and motivational speeches from the Prime Minister renewed the enthusiasm of the village towards the issue. The village restarted its focus on the toilet and 55 toilets were made by October 2015. The village re-attained the status of ODF in December 2015.

During interviews with various officials, it was observed that some officials treated the mission as routine work. They lacked motivation that can enable them to go out of the way to achieve the goals. Besides, some of them didn't have the technical expertise that the work demands.

On closer observation, there are various factors causing such behaviour. Most officials are unhappy because of no incentive of doing good work. Moreover, they have not received any specific training in capacity building that can help them undertake the mission.

In Jharkhand, executive engineers and junior engineers are appointed to take care of the toilet construction. They also look after the awareness drive in the villages. Some of these individuals have not been adequately trained to handle the nuances relating to the publicity and awareness drive for the program.

6.2.7. Lack of Water Supply

There is a direct correlation between the availability of water and the institutionalising the ODF. In Palihari Gurudi of Gomia block and in Bandi village of Tundi Block in Jharkhand, a large number of families have built toilets in their homes. However, they do not use the toilets as they have to carry water from as far as 2-3 kms. Since, the toilet needs large amount of water, they prefer defecating in open.

6.3. Angul Model

In Angul district of the state of Odisha, people along with officials have adopted a unique community-led sanitation model. The district which once faced one of the highest rates of open defecation is now the district with very less open defecation, thanks to the involvement of communities in this endeavour.



The SBM in Odisha faced extreme adversities and the people were reluctant to bring a change in their defecating practices. Widespread poverty and several other socio-economic issues plagued the people and they were least interested in sanitation. This was especially true in the district of Angul where poverty, law and order issues and land acquisition disputes blocked majority of welfare schemes from reaching ground level. However, these challenges were overcome by a unique model of SBM implementation. Thus, Angul has been taken up as a special case.

Fighting all the adversities, over 110 villages in Angul have institutionalised ODF. This was possible because of active public participation, where every individual took the role of ambassador of cleanliness and contributed in the sanitation movement. Group of thirty or less families formed 'Procurement Committee' and collectively constructed toilets. They helped each other in construction and encouraged each other to adopt toilet usage.

Detailed study of the model emphasises that role of leadership, public participation and support of voluntary organisations led to the successful institutionalisation of the ODF. The research team visited 5 villages in Angul block of the district. Mentioned below are the key findings of the research:

6.3.1. Leadership

Similar to other successful institutionalisation model, leadership was pivotal in Angul as well. Sachin Jadhav, the ex-DM of the district, played a pivotal role in leading the communities for institutionalising the ODF. Mr. Jadhav was enthusiastic in implementing SBM in the district, which he accomplished with the help of the community.

Mr. Jadhav has for his credit an innovative model of public participation and financial arrangements. He met the villagers in community meetings and convinced them the harms of open defecation. He would then inspire them to construct toilets and use them. He would invite locals to become part of the 'procurement committees'. The committees were headed by Sarpanch and the book keeping was done by Panchayat Extension Officer (PEO). The committees looked after toilet construction.

Furthermore, Mr Jadhav introduced a new format of fund allocation. He would release funds in the bank accounts of the procurement committees in installment, based on proper utilisation. He would then monitor the supply chain in order to get better bargain in raw materials for the villagers. He also monitored the quality of toilet construction himself.

6.3.2. Work of Voluntary Organisation

Feedback Foundation has worked extensively in the Angul block of the district to institutionalise the ODF process. The activation process involved a specific 'triggering'. The members of the organisation would meet people in village meetings and would draw map of the village with them. The members of the group will then demonstrate how the faecal matter is entering their food cycle. The awareness created disgust among the villagers and forced them to search for the solution.

The foundation brought in innovative tactics at this point. In general practice, the activation would end with the promise of constructing toilet but the awareness created by the 'trigger' would fade away the next day. The foundation disrupted this vicious cycle by introducing the 'Cat Method'. As the name suggests, the families who do not own a toilet would be asked to carry ash or sand from home. They would defecate by digging a 30 cm deep hole and will cover the hole with ash after getting relived. This would continue till the time they do not construct the toilet. Hence, the village will become ODF just after the trigger exercise has finished.



6.3.3. Public Participation

Public participation was critical to the institutionalisation process of Angul. The villagers had enthusiastically participated in the entire ODF attainment process. In order to increase the exercise of public participation, 'Procurement Committees' and 'Nigrani Committees' (monitoring committee) were created.

The procurement committees were constituted with the group of people living in the area. They would look after the financial use and negotiations with the suppliers. They will also look after toilet construction. The members of procurement committees had even lent hand in the toilet construction of the people.

The monitoring committees had also played an important role in the institutionalising the process. Just after the 'trigger' process, the village would form the monitoring committees. Two separate committees for men and women. They would check proper follow up of Cat Method. After the construction of toilet in every household, the committee would fine people who continue to go in open.



A recently constructed toilet in the home of a manual scavenger in Kumrusingha Village, Angul district, Odisha. The practise of collective toilet construction has helped in the promotion of harmony across the communities, an 'indirect' benefit of 'Community led-total Sanitation' encouraged under Swachh Bharat Mission



7. Conclusion

- Leadership, local innovation, public participation and better communication can bring a revolution. Leveraging the models presented by successful villages, a roadmap for making every village ODF can be created.
- The launch of Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM) and personal appeal by Prime Minister Narendra Modi has struck the chord at ground level. Earlier such programs were largely system driven, restricted largely to toilet constructions only. The SBM have transformed the Open Defecation Free movement into a public movement. The SBM became a public driven program and covered not only toilet construction activities but also stressed on mindset change and adoption to clean practices. Newly established SBM structures have motivated officials, local leadership and villagers at large to institutionalise ODF.
- The renewed incentive of Rs. 12,000 for toilet construction is one of the major driving factors of the SBM. Countless families, who hardly earn enough for two times food, are now proud owners of toilets. Hence, owning a toilet is gradually becoming aspirational.
- Leadership has occupied the central stage for the creation of an ODF villages. The local leadership demonstrated in cases such as Hiware Bazar of Ahmednagar district and Mohare of Kolhapur district has succeeded in changing the mindset of people. Bureaucratic leadership displayed by District Magistrates of Angul, Odisha and Wardha, Maharashtra show that proper implementation of the welfare schemes can bring changes in the lives of people. Spiritual leadership as discerned in Shelkewadi of Kolhapur district and Sirsoli of Wardha district of Maharashtra has witnessed a behavioural change in villagers.
- However, lack of a strong leadership was observed as a dominant trait in the villages who failed to institutionalise ODF. Lack of motivation among SBM officers, missing push from the top level and disillusionment amongst officials were major challenges. In several villages, the leaders, who are designated to promote the sanitation movements, do not personally own toilets. They were neither interested nor trained to handle the social issues like toilet construction.
- The partnership with voluntary organisations has positive outcomes and the SBM has received a push. They have brought the best of global and national practices to ground level and have accomplished commendable job in activating and creating awareness. In spite of that, some organisations were unsuccessful in making any ground impact due to lack of monitoring. An absence of a mechanism to measure their work and thus making them accountable is a challenge.
- The biggest challenge that the ODF movement faces is in bringing behavioural change. The successful villages
 have successfully changed the behaviour of people. They have imbibed the practice of toilet usage as norm.
 On contrary, in the villages which failed the ODF institutionalisation, the idea of regular toilet usage is still not
 considered as a social norm. Even after the toilet construction at home, people prefer defecating in open.
 Besides, regular revisions in the incentive structure have created a mindset that the incentive will further
 increase, thus deterring the current growth rate in toilet adoption.
- The successful villages have also emphasised on community participation. These villages have ensured the local participation in building, monitoring and maintaining toilets. On the other hand, the villages which failed to institutionalise had least public participation. People in such villages considered the toilet construction as the government's job and they lacked sense of ownership. Hence, lack of active participation has resulted in failure of ODF institutionalisation.
- The availability of water is one of the important factors for ODF institutionalisation. The regions that have ample and easy supply of water have succeeded. It has failed in the village where water availability is not ensured.



- Women have been the driving force in the movement of creating ODF villages. They have persuaded villages and communities to construct toilets. The administration has also focused on informing and educating women in this regard, realising their influence in the decision making. Women in some villages still defecate in open, arguing that they socialise while doing so.
- Children are the second most important persuaders in the ODF institutionalisation. Several villages demonstrated that the toilet adoption can be promoted by encouraging and educating children. Villages have toilets in their school, but most of them were found to be not functional. Encouraging the adoption of toilets from as early as in Anganwadis and primary schools have helped villages like Hiware Bazar create a generation of young people who have inculcated the safe sanitation habits.
- Constant follow up and monitoring was also observed as an important part of the ODF mission. The successful villages ensured that there was a constant follow up of the IEC campaigns. They were constantly reminded of the importance of toilet adoption. Despite that, several villages which were once ODF are witnessing people defecating in open again. The research suggested that the withdrawal of efforts such as IEC campaigns, regular monitoring and mentoring of the villagers resulted in this. The lack of any further incentive for using toilet deterred people further and they went back to defecating in open.

8. Key Learnings

- A strong push by top leadership and personal appeal has potential to bring the positive change.
- Right amount of financial incentive help social welfare initiatives.
- Behavioral change, encouraging public participation are the key factors of the success of Swachh Bharat Mission.
- Local leadership helps drive the movement towards institutionalising ODF habits.
- Different geographies and different societies draw its inspiration from varied sources. Hence, identifying that motivating force and tapping into that shall be highly useful for the purpose.
- Role of voluntary organisations is critical but monitoring their work is equally important.
- Easy availability of water helps sustain the ODF habits.
- Creating awareness among women and children has potential to institutionalise toilet usage.

9. Recommendations

Sustainable development comes with a precondition of safe sanitation. The ODF villages ensure basic sanitation and thereby healthy societies. The GoI has the target to make our country ODF by 2019. In order to achieve the goal, this empirical study has identified several key issues that need to be addressed in a phased manner.

9.1. Strengthening the Base

9.1.1. Modification in the Incentive Model

One of the major findings during the research is that the constant revision in the incentive is negatively impacting the speed of the SBM. The current incentive of Rs. 12,000 should be made time-bound. Households constructing beyond the given time shall be incentivised by marginally lower amount. Every such incentive should have a



timeline. This will encourage the households to make toilets in the shorter time. Also, active participation of the villagers in monitory terms should be encouraged by incentivising such community.

For the families who constructed the toilets under previous schemes and do not have functional toilets, a scheme to provide financial help to maintain the toilet is also recommended.

9.1.2. Policy for Encroachment Dwellers

The Swachh Bharat Mission do not permit incentive of toilet construction for people living on encroached lands. The research recommends a public toilet scheme for encroachment dwellers. Under the scheme, the families can be given right to use the toilets with responsibility to maintain them.

9.1.3. Ensuring Public Participation

Option of contribution by public or beneficiaries can be explored. This may include a partial amount of money or a contribution in labour for constructing toilet.

Public participation in propagating the importance of toilet adoption and other IEC campaigns is also recommended. The local leaders, PRI members, school teachers and other thought leaders of the village have mass appeal and can convince people to change behaviour. Hence, the ODF committees involving members of PRI structure is recommended in every state.

9.1.4. Ensuring Water Supply

It is recommended to ensure water supply in every village to encourage people in creating habit of toilet usage. The water availability can be ensured by piped water connection or construction of hand pumps and water wells near every habitat.

9.1.5. Convincing People for Utility of Three Feet Deep Pit

The guideline to construct two 3 feet deep pits has been suggested in the SBM. However, there have been several instances throughout the country where people are not convinced by this structure. In a recent media report, its remarked that 'Almost every household in Dausod village of Rajasthan, building latrines with single pits which are twice as big – 20 to 40 feet deep and 5 to 7 feet wide – and cost Rs. 20,000 to Rs. 30,000. They fear that the smaller pits will fill up too quickly. It is the same in the nearby villages of the state.'^{xxi}

A campaign to educate the people who are confused with the utility of 3 feet deep pit is recommended. The research found that there was widespread myth that the toilet pit might be filled in a very short time. The myth needs to be tackled with a national campaign.

9.2. Bringing Behavioural Change

9.2.1. Focus on Behavioural Change by Innovative IEC Campaigns

'Roti, Kapda, Makaan aur Shauchalaya'

A perception that 'the lack of toilet is unacceptable', is yet to be established. The SBM needs an extensive campaign to trigger this thought. Hence, a change in the strategy of IEC (Information, education and communication) campaigns is recommended.



The messaging of the campaigns should be reworked to communicate that the construction of toilets is an individual's basic need and responsibility. The movement requires impactful IEC campaigns that can convince people that construction of toilet is part of an individual's dignity and it is equivalent to 'Roti, Kapda aur Makaan'.

9.2.2. Motivation for Already Established Model Villages

It is recommended that incentives be given for maintaining sanitation habits. For example, a possible incentive can be to provide tapped water supply to the villages who have achieved ODF status. Such incentives can also help the Gol in other missions including Indira Awas Yojana and in fighting malnutrition.

9.2.3. Continuation of Monitoring Committees

A committee at village, district and state level should be established to monitor the developments of the SBM. It is also suggested to include locals, voluntary workers and leaders in the committee. Moreover, these committees should continue even after the village has achieved the ODF status and be handed responsibility to monitor the implementation of other welfare schemes.

9.2.4. Performance Based Incentive to SBM Employees

The employees handling the administration of SBM lack motivation. They complained of the lack of incentives for doing great work. The introduction of a performance-based incentives for the employees handling the planning and execution of the SBM is recommended. This will help the government to accelerate the speed of implementation of policy.

9.2.5. Compulsory Toilets for Contesting Elections at PRI Level

In Haryana, it has been made compulsory to have a toilet at home to contest Sarpanch elections. Because of this rule, the state witnessed the construction of as many as 51530 toilets, just before the PRI elections. At this backdrop, it is recommended that compulsory possession of toilet should be made compulsory for contesting in elections and also for government officials. This way, leaders can set example for the common people, and make the toilet construction aspirational.

9.3. Sustainable Change

9.3.1. Making Clean Sanitation Part of Primary Education

The children can act as the mascots of sanitation, provided they are well-informed and encouraged. Making safe sanitation practices and habits of toilet adoption part of education in Anganwadis and primary schools is recommended.

9.3.2. Encouraging Construction of Solid Liquid Waste management (SLWM) System

The Government of India already has a policy for the 'Solid and Liquid Waste Management (SLWM) under SBM. In fact, the SBM guidelines state that SLWM is one of the key components of the mission^{xxii} and there are strict guidelines for planning and execution of the same. However, the implementation of the policy is not prioritised at the ground level. Both administration and the villages had 'toilet construction' as their prime focus. The guidelines state that 'Every State should have at least one SLWM Consultant at the State level and one SLWM Consultant in each District DWSM/DWSC to guide the preparations of the SLWM projects for each GP^{xxiii}'. Nevertheless, no ground level execution of the guidelines of the programme. Furthermore, the research also found that SLWM was also ignored in the IEC campaigns executed under the mission.



The research also recommends linking of SLWM with organic farming. The method of vermicomposting can be utilised to create additional opportunities and help the village economy.

9.3.3. Training and Capacity Building

The research found 'lack of training' as one of the key challenges for the people working at the ground level. The 'Gram Sevaks' who execute most of the schemes at the village level do not have specific training in SLWM and are not aware of the best practices relating to SBM. Similar training for village leadership, members of PRIs and district officials is needed for the better execution of the schemes. It is also suggested to include watershed management, use of non conventional energy, promotion of cooperatives and leadership training in the module for training and capacity building.

It is also suggested to engage the voluntary organisations working at ground level in training the stakeholders of SBM. The expertise of NGO's should come under the Public system. A PPPP (Public Private People Partnership) model of training is recommended.

9.3.4. Building a Knowledge Sharing Platform

The Swachh Bharat Mission has successfully proven how local innovation can give solution to the most rigid problems. Several great practices are being evolved and developed in different parts of the country. Many villages have innovated in toilet construction and the structure of the pits. Several villages have managed their waste and are using them as compost. The research recommends a platform where the successful practices can be shared with each other. The community dialogue among the leaders of villages who have successfully institutionalised the ODF status and the ones who have failed. These interactions will help strengthen the SBM.

A mobile visual exhibition of such documentation is also recommended. Such exhibition can demonstrate how sanitation changed lives of people and inspire people to follow the same.

9.3.5. Incentive to the Transformers

The research also observed that many village leaders worked tirelessly to help villages achieve the ODF status and institutionalise the habits in their lives. However, if they could not contest/ win elections the next time, they would feel disillusioned. Hence, for encouraging the leadership, the Sarpanch and ward member during whose tenure, the village has achieved the ODF status may be nominated for the next term without voting rights.



Acknowledgement

- Shri Popatrao Pawar Hiware Bazar, Ahmadnagar
- Dr. Bindeshwar Pathak Sulabh International
- Shri Bharat (Appa) Patil Kadoli, Kolhapur
- Shri Shri Kadsiddheshwar Swami Ji Kaneri Math, Kolhapur
- Shri Chandu Patil Rajgad, Chandrapur
- Shri Ravindra Sathe Executive Director, Rambhau Mhalgi Prabodhini
- Shri Neelkanth Singh Munda (Rural development minister, Jharkhand)
- Shri Pramod Kumar (Resident Editor, Hindustan, Dhanbad)
- Shri Anoop kumar lal (Ranchi)
- Shri N.N. Sinha (Secretary Rural Development, Jharkhand)
- Shri Rajesh Sharma (Deputy Director SUDA, SPMG, Ranchi)
- Shri Sachin Jadhav (Director Housing, Bhuvneshwar, Odisa)
- Shri Dhananjay (Project Director DRDA, Angul, Odisa)
- Mrs. Anuradha (Project Coordinator SBM, Angul District, Odisa)
- Dr. Anand Shekhar (Delhi, GSF)
- Shri Vinay Tiwari (Delhi, GSF)
- Shri Ashwin Kumar Sahu (Feedback Foundation)
- Shri Saroj Kumar (Feedback Foundation)
- Shri Prakash Pani (Feedback Foundation)
- Shri Manoj Singh (Ranchi)
- Dr. Sanjeev Shekhar Jha (Ranchi, GSF)
- Shri Vikas Singh (SBM, District coordinator, Saraikela)
- Shri Sanjay Prasad (SDO, Kharsavan)
- Shri Harender Kumar Mishra (EE, Saraikela)
- Shri Shivnath Ram (EE, Dhanbad)
- Shri Dayashankar Prasad (A.E., Dhanbad)
- Shri Sujoy Kundu (Saraikela)
- Shri Subir Kumar Das (Saraikela)
- Shri Rahul (Bokaro)
- Shri Chaitanya Barsawade (Research Fellow)

Maharashtra Villages

Hivare Bazar

- Sachin Thorat Gramsevak, Hivare Bazar
- Raosaheb Ranoji Pawar Senior citizen farmer



- Habib sayad young Villager
- Nitin Pawar young grocery store owner
- Raghunath & Madhav Bangar Biogas unit owner Farmer

Kingaon

- Kalyan Bhikaji Chavan Deputy Sarpanch
- Pandurang Najan Sarpanch
- Tejrao Patil Chavan Ex-Sarpanch
- P. V. Kale Gramsevak, Kingaon
- Sakhubai Ranganath Pawar Grampanchayat Member
- Sanjeev Uttamrao Chavan Teacher
- Khandu Gaikwad Villager
- A. P. Nikam Health sub centre worker

Sidhagiri Math, Kaneri

- Adrushya Kadsidheshwar Maharaj (49th Mathadhipati, Kadsidheshwar Math)
- Vikram Patil Arogyadham Hospital, Sidhagiri Math

Mohare

- Yashwant More Dy. Sarpanch
- Surekha Dongare Sarpanch
- Shivaji More Ex Sarpanch
- Pramod Dongre Teacher
- Mrs. Shilpa Sachin Mohite Self Help Grpup Leader (Ankur Mahila Bachat Gat)
- Mrs. Chanda Tate Self Help Group, Leader (Vaibhavlaxmi Mahila Bachat Gat)

Ambavade

- Rajendra Vilas Jadhav Dy. Sarpanch
- Hambirrao Shankar Jagdale Villager
- Ramchandra Kashid Journalist, Panhala Block

Shelkewadi

36

- Yogita Jaysing Shelke Sarpanch
- Jaysing Shelke Ex Sarpanch
- Rupali Pohalkar Gramsevika, Shelkewadi
- Sangeeta Eknath Shelke Ex Sarpanch

Kolhapur Zilla Parishad

- Mrs. Shilpa Desai Dy. CEO, Zilla Parishad, Kolhapur
- Kiran Kulkarni Dy. Collector, Kolhapur
- Sagar Pandit Sarvane Gramsevak, Village Kambalwadi, Taluka – Radhanagari
- Vijay Patil, District Program Manager, Swachha Bharat Mision
- Nishant Kamble Social Science Expert
- Chandrakant Kabade District Co-ordinater, IEC campaign

Salvan

- M. L. Akiwate Gramsevak, Salvan
- Shilpa Dilip Shirke Sarpanch
- Arun Balu Mangle Dy. Sarpanch
- Savita Gangaram Padval Anganwadi Tai (Teacher)
- Ujwala Raghunath Patil Aasha Worker

Nivade

• Anil Anantrao Khade – Gream panchayat Clerk

Borchandali

- Usha Durge Sarpanch
- Gaurav Pupreddywar Dy. Sarpanch
- D. S. Chavan Gramsevak, Borchanali

Virai

- Shaarad Prabhakar Jengathe Sarpanch
- Bandu Rushi Gongale Dy. Sarpanch
- V. S. Telmasre Gramsevak, Virai
- Shyamrao Dhole Grampanchayat Peon
- Pradip Wadhai Ex Sarpanch

Rajgarh

- Chandu Patil Dy. Sarpanch
- Sangeeta Pramod Hajare Sarpanch
- Rajesh Ture Gramsevak, Rajgad
- Mrs. Priti Ratan Khobragade Anganwadi Helper
- Madhavi Madhvi Docter
- Milind Bhau Supale Rashtrasant Tukdoji Maharaj Sanstha Pracharak

Chandapur

- Suresh Chandorwar Gramsevak, Chandapur
- Lata Narendra Chincholkar Sarpanch

Panchayat Samiti, Mul

- Pradip Pandharbale BDO, Panchayat Samiti, Mul
- Jayendra Krishnaji Raut Extension officer, SBM, Panchayat samiti, Mul
- Prakash S. Umak Social Scientist, SBM

Wardha

- Ashutosh Salil District Collector, Wardha
- Sanjay Mina CEO, Zilla Parishad, Wardha
- Sachin Mukundrao Khade District Program Manager, SBM
- Pravinkumar Wankhade BDO, Panchayat Samiti, Aarvi
- Narayan Sanap Asst. BDO Wardha
- Rahul Sarang Tahasildar, Wardha

Dhaman Gaon-Wathoda

- Jayashri S. Nehare Sarpanch
- Prafull Shankar Kuchewar Dy. Sarpanch
- Hiratai Ajay Sawarkar Gramsevika, DhamanGaon-Wathoda

Pimpalgaon – Wadala

- Suchita Raju Jadhav Sarpanch
- Sushila Bhanudas Meshram Dy. Sarpanch
- Prashant Ramteke Gramsevak
- Rajendra Jadhav Member, Grampanchayat
- Gajanan Keshavrao Nikam Member, Zilla Parishad, Wardha

Sirsoli

- Kalpanatai Dolas Sarpanch
- Arunrao Wagh Dy. Sarpanch
- Rizwan Pathan Gramsevak, Sirsoli
- Revashankar Wagh Ex Sarpanch

Waghdhara

- Ramesh Salunkhe Gramsevak, Waghdhara
- Kalpana Sanjay Phulkar Sarpanch
- Sanjay Phulkar Member, Grampanchayat
- Kusum Rupchand Khobragade Anganwadi tai (Worker)
- Manisha Dhanraj Ghode Anganwadi tai (Worker)
- Varsha Vasudev Aaskar Anganwadi tai (Worker)

Others

- Sidharth Shirole Pune
- Jayant Pathak Nagpur
- Yogesh Kedar Delhi
- Rahul Patil Kaneri Math
- Amit Chandane Kaneri Math
- Abhishek Patil Rajgad
- Rahul Tokekar RMP, Pune

Jharkhand Villages

Krushnopur

- Shukurmuni Oraon Mukhiya
- Laxmi Mahato Jal Sahiya
- Usha Mehto Anganwadi Sewika (Anganwadi no. 2)
- Damyanti Mehto Anganwadi Sewika (Anganwadi no. 1)
- Rajaram Mehto Purv Mukhiya
- Shiv Kumar Das School teacher

Kalajharna

- Budhram lamay Gram Pradhan
- Sombari devgam Jal Sahiya
- Mangal soy Villager
- Sunil soy Villager
- Dulu soy Villager
- Sushma Pradhan Anganwadi Sewika

Chota Gamhariya

• Nirola Sardar – Mukhiya



- Manmati Mahato Jal Sahiya (State level award winning Jalsahiya)
- Asha Mehto Panchayat Samiti Sadasya
- Sunita Devi Ward Member (Ward-12)

Hatinada

- Vimla Majhi Mukhiya
- Fudan Majhi Jal Sahiya
- Shefali Gop Gram Samiti, Upadhyaksh
- Aukhuram Majhi Purv Mukhiya
- Sanuram Majhi School teacher

Kadamdih

- Manju Bodhra Purv Mukhiya
- Indrani Devi Jal Sahiya
- Nasreen Parveen Anganwadi sewika

Chilku

- Ramlal Honhanga Mukhiya
- Menka Mandal Jal Sahiya
- Chinmayi Ganguli Anganwadi sewika
- Ravindranath Puthal Block coordinater IDF
- Vikas Kumar Ward Member (Ward- 08)
- Shanti Sardar Ward Member (Ward-05)
- Anita Devi Ward Member (Ward-15)
- Sumitra Sardar Villager
- Noni Majhi Anganwadi Sewika
- Damyanti Mehto Anganwadi Sewika (Anganwadi no. 1)
- Rajaram Mehto Purv Sarpanch
- Shiv Kumar Das School teacher
- Prabhakar Mandal Panchayat Samiti Sadasya
- Shambhunath Mandal Ward member

Saharjodi

- Savitri Devi Mukhiya
- Poonam Jal Sahiya
- Jalil Ansari Villager
- Ranju Kumar Block coordinator

- Anjit Kumar Mehto Cluster coordinator
- Manjur Alam Upmukhiya
- Kantikumari School Teacher

Tatri South

- Teena Devi Mukhiya
- Beena Devi Jal Sahiya
- Sahida Khatoon Purva Panchayat Samiti Sadasya

Kamlapur

- Sumitra Devi Mukhiya
- Sangita Devi Jal Sahiya
- Supriya Jha SBM Coordinator
- Vikas Jha Villager
- Nusrat Jahan Anganwadi Sewika

Palihari Gurudi

- Lalita Devi Mukhiya
- Mohanlal Ex Mukhiya
- Suman Devi Jal Sahiya
- Bhavna Gupta SBM Block Coordinator
- Manoj kumar Villager

Parastand

- Nemiya Devi Mukhiya
- HeeraMuni Murmu Jal Sahiya
- Praveen Kumar Lal Block Coordinator GSF
- Vikas Jha Villager
- Geeta Devi– Anganwadi Sewika

Bandih

- Rameshwar Vaski Mukhiya
- Tulsi Devi Jal Sahiya
- Nonhu Lal Soren Villager

Salaiya

- Reeta Mishr Mukhiya
- Meena Soren Jal Sahiya
- Prabhudan Bhaski Villager

38) Making Villages Open Defecation Free

Dumra South

- Namrata Devi Mukhiya
- Kaushalya Devi Ex. Mukhiya
- Gopal Singh UpMukhiya
- Sangeeta Devi Jal Sahiya
- Uttam Kumar Rajwara Villager

Kumardih

- Mihir Mandal Mukhiya
- Anita Devi Jal Sahiya
- Anil Kumar Ravidas Villager

Dhartichak

- Marjeena Biwi Jal Sahiya
- Rakesh Ranjan Block Coordinator GSF
- Rajiv Kumar Singh Villager
- Sukhdev Kaul Villager

Peshar Pur

- Kiran Kisku Mukhiya
- Rupamani Devi Jal Sahiya
- Ashok Rawani Villager

Ramodih

- Bablu Kumar Paswan Mukhiya
- Sarita Devi Jal Sahiya
- Balgovind Singh Villager

Bhoktachorat

- Maqbul Ansari Mukhiya
- Rukmani Devi Jal Sahiya

- Suchindra Bhagat Block Coordinator GSF
- Seetaram Yadav Villager
- Bharat Kumar Yadav Teacher

Jariatad

- Anjum Ara Jal Sahiya
- Lukman Ansari Villager

Pahadpur

- Raju Yadav Mukhiya
- Sunita Hemram Jal Sahiya
- Gono Kaul Villager

Odisha Villages

Kumuri Singha

- Duryodhan Sahu Sarpanch
- Vikas Chandra Mehman Singh-Villager

Shankhapur

• Jyotirmayi Dehuri – Sarpanch

Saharagoda

• Kuni Sahu – Sarpanch

Gohirapasi

- Duryodhan Sahu Sarpanch
- Vikas Chandra Mehman Singh Village



Citations

¹ WHO-UNICEF. 2014. "Joint Monitoring Programme (JMP) for Water Supply and Sanitation". Available online at http://www.wssinfo.org/fileadmin/user_upload/resources/JMP_report_2014_webEng.pdf

ⁱⁱ http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/Jharkhands-open-defecation-rate-worst/articleshow/26016010.cms

^{III} Pratham. 2013. "Annual Status of Education Report (Rural) 2012". Available online at www.pratham.org/file/ ASER-2012report.pdf

^{iv} Economics of Sanitation Initiative. 2010. "Inadequate Sanitation Costs India Rs 2.4 Trillion (US\$53.8 billion). World Bank Report – Water & Sanitation Programme. Available online at www.wsp.org/sites/wsp.org/files/publications/ wsp-esi-india.pdf

^v http://www.who.int/water_sanitation_health/publications/factsfigures04/en/

vi http://unicef.in/Whatwedo/11/Eliminate-Open-Defecation

^{vii} http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/India-loses-Rs-24000cr-annually-due-to-lack-of-toilets-hygiene-World-Bank/articleshow/7135478.cms

^{viii} Background - Guidelines of Swachh Bharat Mission (Grameen), Page 2

^{ix} http://www.indiatvnews.com/news/india/construction-of-toilets-will-not-address-india-sanitationwoes-42919.html

[×] http://articles.economictimes.indiatimes.com/2015-11-07/news/68089713_1_swachh-bharat-mission-new-cess-finance-ministry

^{xi} http://sbm.gov.in/sbm_new/AboutSBM.aspx

^{xii} http://www.mediamirchi.com/motaphala

xiii http://www.bbc.com/hindi/india/2015/05/150505_first_open_defecation_district_nadia_sr

^{xiv} http://zeenews.india.com/news/west-bengal/wb-three-more-districts-to-be-freed-of-opendefecation_1586162.html

^{xv} http://www.livemint.com/Politics/zIGD30xaYydZA8Z8x60FEN/Changing-mindsets-the-Churu-way.html

^{xvi} http://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/it-happened-in-bikaner/

^{xvii}http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/armed-with-whistles-children-to-deter-open-defecation/ article6558079.ece

^{xviii} http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/Jharkhands-open-defecation-rate-worst/articleshow/26016010. cmsm

^{xix} http://www.communityledtotalsanitation.org/sites/communityledtotalsanitation.org/files/Process_ Documentation_Angul.pdf

^{xx} http://www.cprindia.org/sites/default/files/policy-briefs/sbm_2015.pdf

^{xxi}http://scroll.in/article/759201/swachh-bharat-in-rajasthan-a-village-shows-why-open-defecation-is-ending-only-on-paper

^{xxii} http://www.and.nic.in/archives/rdpri/downloads/guidelines_Swachh_Bharat_Mission_Gramin.pdf

^{xxiii} Page 18 - http://www.and.nic.in/archives/rdpri/downloads/guidelines_Swachh_Bharat_Mission_Gramin.pdf



